



ORGANISATION DE L'AVIATION  
CIVILE INTERNATIONALE

INTERNATIONAL CIVIL  
AVIATION ORGANIZATION

**Internal Audit Report**  
**on**  
**The Eastern and Southern African (ESAF)**  
**Regional Office**

**IA/2022/1**

**Office of Internal Oversight**

## CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY .....	1
Overall Conclusion.....	1
Acknowledgement.....	2
RESULTS OF THE AUDIT .....	3
Background .....	3
Audit Objectives and Scope.....	3
Audit Findings and Recommendations .....	3
I. Programme Management.....	3
II. Risk Management .....	5
III. Human Resources.....	6
IV. Information Technology.....	7
V. Business Continuity and Safety and Security Measures .....	8
VI. Procurement.....	9
VII. Hiring of Translators and Interpreters.....	10
VIII. Asset Management.....	10
IX. Home Security Payments.....	11
ANNEX 1: DEFINITION OF AUDIT TERMS.....	I
ANNEX 2: MANAGEMENT ACTION PLAN .....	II

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

---

1. As part of its annual work plan for 2021 (C-WP/15114), the Office of Internal Oversight (OIO) carried out an audit of the Eastern and Southern African Regional Office (ESAF). The audit was conducted in conformance with the International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing<sup>1</sup>. Due to the ongoing Covid-19 pandemic, a significant portion of the audit work was carried out remotely from Headquarters in Montreal.
2. The objectives of the audit were to review the effectiveness and efficiency of key internal controls, risk management, business processes, and programme management in the ESAF Regional Office.
3. Results Based Management (RBM) is at the early stages of implementation in the regional office. Planned activities and outputs in the ESAF operating plan and work programme are not clearly linked to expected results, and targets are largely based on numbers of activities/outputs rather than on expected outcomes. In addition, many targets are not within the direct control of the Regional Office and are dependent on delivery of actions by States. The Regional Office has also not established baselines against which to measure the extent of changes/improvements achieved from year to year. Finally, Key Performance Indicators need to be developed in such a way to allow for an effective performance measurement. Also, ESAF office has not been able to report on its performance in the Corporate Management Reporting Tool (CMRT) since April 2021 due to technical problems which remain unresolved to-date.
4. ESAF maintains a Regional Office risk register, which is outdated. It is of crucial importance that the regional office actively identifies and manages all relevant key risks to the implementation of its own objectives and operations.
5. For major organizational initiatives such as RBM and ERM to be successfully implemented, they need to be driven by headquarters, and coordinated across the whole Organization to provide Regional Offices with appropriate and sufficient training, advice and guidance.
6. Delays have occurred in filling several posts in the regional office. In particular, the Administrative Officer position in ESAF, has been vacant for more than 60% of the time in the last five and a half years. The latest recruitment process has now been completed and the selected candidate is expected to start in December 2021. There is a need for HR to review its current procedures to ensure that ICAO is able to attract and recruit the best candidates in a timely manner.
7. The ESAF office manages data back-ups on the regional office servers, however, data from backup tapes has never been tested for restoration. In October 2021, a new back-up process has been set up by Headquarters using cloud storage under the One ICAO project; which will also facilitate restoration of data from cloud storage.
8. The ESAF office has developed a Business Continuity Plan (BCP) which was updated and approved in August 2020. ESAF should update the current Business Continuity Plan based on the outcome of the Business Impact Analysis (BIA) being carried out by ADB including lessons learned from the experience of the Covid-19 pandemic.

### Overall Conclusion

9. Based on the results of the audit, OIO has given an audit rating of "Some Improvement Needed". This means that controls evaluated are generally adequate, appropriate, and effective to provide reasonable assurance that risks are being managed and objectives should be met. However, a few

---

<sup>1</sup> IIA Standard 1321

specific control weaknesses or areas for improvement were noted. Annex 1 provides further information on the definition of audit terms used in OIO's internal audit reports.

10. This report includes seven recommendations including three high priority recommendations. The significant risks identified during the audit are associated with improvements in operating plans and linkages with Enterprise Risk Management and Results Based Management, ESAF risk management, and IT controls. Other areas for improvement include: mission reporting, recruiting staff to fill key vacancies; the development and application of consistent organization-wide procedures for the recruitment of freelance interpreters and translators, and updating of the ESAF Business Continuity Plan. All the recommendations have been accepted by the Management. Management comments and proposed actions to implement the recommendations are detailed in the Management Action Plan at Annex 2.

### Acknowledgement

11. OIO wishes to thank management and staff for their assistance and cooperation during the audit, particularly in the light of the difficult working conditions imposed by the ongoing pandemic.

## RESULTS OF THE AUDIT

---

### Background

12. The Eastern and Southern African (ESAF) Regional Office is located in Nairobi, Kenya together with other UN organizations at the UN common premises in Gigiri.
13. The regional office is accredited to 24 states in the eastern and southern sub region of Africa. Its mission is to liaise closely with the States, appropriate organizations, and regional civil aviation bodies, to promote ICAO policies, decisions, standards and recommended practices, and air navigation plans, and to provide assistance whenever possible.
14. There are 25 budgeted staff positions in the ESAF office. At the time of the audit, 23 of these were filled and there were two vacant posts in the process of recruitment. The total budgeted cost of the office for the 2020-2022 triennium is CAN \$11.54 million.

### Audit Objectives and Scope

15. The objectives of the audit were to assess:
  - the design and effectiveness of key internal controls in the main operational areas such as human resources, procurement, IT and mission travel;
  - the adequacy of the regional office risk register in capturing the key risks facing the regional office and ICAO in the region; and
  - the implementation of operating plans, their link to the ICAO Business Plan, and overall programme management, monitoring, and reporting on regional office activities.
16. The scope of the audit covered activities and transactions in the period from January 2019 to June 2021. Due to the Covid-19 Pandemic and associated travel restrictions initially, the portion of fieldwork was conducted remotely from headquarters and complemented with on-site audit work at a later stage.

### Audit Findings and Recommendations

#### I. Programme Management

##### Review of ESAF Operating Plans

17. The Corporate Management and Reporting Tool (CMRT) became operational in 2017. The CMRT is a web-based system developed to manage the Business Plan and to report on the progress of implementation of the operating plans. Though the operating plan performance data is available in CMRT for the years 2019 and 2020, ESAF is unable to report the performance of 2021 operating plan in CMRT since April 2021 due to unavailability of CMRT. ESAF office took up the matter with Strategic Planning, Coordination and Partnerships Office (SPCP) and ICT for resolution of technical difficulties but it remains unresolved as of November 2021.
18. Furthermore, as changes and updates in the annual operating plan objectives are not permitted within CMRT, the ESAF prepares an annual Work Programme in Excel which provides a detailed timetable for the various activities to be undertaken. Given that the work of the Regional Office is dynamic, any unplanned activities or required changes to activities during the year will be reflected in the Work Programme, but not in the operating plan. Although the activities in the Work

Programme are based on the objectives and deliverables in the operating plan, there is no clearly traceable link from the Work Programme back to the operating plan.

19. The monitoring of the operating plan should be flexible enough to enable effective management of the planned activities without the need to maintain a separate Excel or Word documents.
20. Consistent with findings in other OIO reports, notably the Evaluation of Results Based Management (EV/2019/2), which describe weaknesses in results based management at the organizational level, the planned activities and outputs of the ESAF office are not clearly linked to the outcomes which they enable. Also, the operating plan objectives are also not aligned and linked with the PACE (Performance and Competency Enhancement) report objectives of staff members. Up to now, the training received by ESAF on RBM has been limited. The training provided by the SPCP has mainly been on how to upload information to the CMRT.
21. Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) in the ESAF operating plans are largely based on numbers of activities/outputs (such as the number of meetings to be conducted) rather than on outcomes/changes to be achieved. In addition, there are many targets, which are dependent on delivery of actions by States. Setting of meaningful targets is a challenge, however they should be more realistic and measurable, and there needs to be clarity about what the Regional Office can control or influence and what it cannot.
22. Planned improvements/increased performance should also be measured against previously established baselines in order to assess the extent of change achieved.
23. ESAF office works closely with the Western and Central African (WACAF) Regional Office and others to coordinate their respective work programmes and to ensure that there is no duplication, however, reporting on the achievement of results of joint activities is done independently by each Regional Office. **There is no organizational mechanism to capture aggregated performance data on joint activities.**

Recommendation 1	Improvements in Operating plans and linkages with Enterprise Risk Management and Results Based Management
Priority	High
ESAF, in association with SPCP, should ensure	
a) Availability of CMRT for regular reporting	
b) Effective linkage of Regional Office operating plans with corporate and RO risk registers as well as individual staff performance objectives in PACE	
Closing criteria:	
a) Resolution of technical problems faced in CMRT	
b) Review and revision of RO Operating plans	

### Mission Travel

24. Mission travel by the Regional Office has been suspended since March 2020 due to the ongoing Covid-19 pandemic. The selected sample therefore included 10 missions conducted in 2019 and early 2020 to assess linkages to planned objectives and outcomes, and whether mission reports included relevant and useful information on the results achieved.
25. Prior to each mission, the *ESAF Regional Office Mission Description and Approval Form* is completed, and submitted to the Deputy Regional Director and Regional Director for approval. This form, which requires the staff member to provide a description of the objectives of the mission and the expected outcome before the Travel Authorization is raised, represents an example of good

practice. The form was completed in the case of all the sampled missions. The staff member is also required to indicate on the form whether the mission was provided for in the Work Programme, and if so to provide the relevant reference. In all cases the reference was recorded as "ESAF Office Work Programme" without any clear indication of which objective or outcome in the operating plan would be met by the proposed mission. In addition, in three cases, the activity was not actually included in the ESAF Work Programme since these were unplanned missions based on special invitations received during the year.

26. After a mission has been completed, staff members are required to prepare a mission report to document the results and outcomes achieved. A mission report was completed in 8 of the 10 cases sampled. Whilst these mission reports did provide a detailed description of what was achieved during the mission, the focus was generally on the activities carried out and the decisions reached. The outcomes were not clearly articulated or linked back to the operating plan objectives and targets.

Recommendation 2	Mission planning and reporting
Priority	Medium
ESAF should ensure that all planned missions are clearly linked to the achievement of an expected outcome in the operating plan, and that mission reports provide information on actual outcomes achieved with reference to operating plan objectives and targets.	
Closing criteria:	
Inclusion of a clear link on the <i>Mission Description and Approval Form</i> between the proposed mission and the related operating plan objective/target.	
Mission reports to describe outcomes, and include a reference to the related operating plan objectives and targets.	

## II. Risk Management

27. Key risks relating to all Regional Offices have been identified and included in the recently updated Corporate Risk Register, which was presented to the Council in August 2021.
28. Additionally, ESAF had started to develop its own risk register, but this has now become outdated. It is of crucial importance for the Regional Office to actively identify, mitigate, and monitor risks to the implementation of its own objectives and operations.
29. OIO has already raised the issue for SPCP to provide all Regional Offices with adequate training, advice and guidance on the development of Regional Office risk registers. The risk terminology needs to be consistent and clearly understood by all staff, and the risk register template itself should be fit for purpose and not overly complex. A successful ERM requires a clear understanding and active participation of all staff on an ongoing basis.

Recommendation 3	Risk Management
Priority	High
ESAF, in close cooperation with SPCP, should update its RO Risk Register ensuring that all key risks are identified and managed effectively to ensure the achievement of business plan/ operation plan objectives.	
Closing criteria:	
Review and update of ESAF risk register.	

### III. Human Resources

#### Staffing

30. As shown in Table 1, there are 25 budgeted posts in the Regional Office. At the time of the audit, there were two vacant posts: the P-3 Administrative Officer, and the P-3 Regional Officer, Air Traffic Management and Search and Rescue. These two posts had been vacant since 15 August 2020 and 2 December 2018 respectively.

	Director	Professional	General Service	Total
Male	1	10	3	14
Female		2	7	9
Vacant		2		2
Total	1	14	10	25

TABLE – 1: Staff Statistics

31. The P-3 Administrative Officer is an important post in the Regional Office, responsible for managing all of the financial and other key administrative matters of the office. However, in the last 68 months (between February 2016 and September 2021), the post has been vacant for more than 41 months (61% of the time).
32. Following the resignation of the incumbent in August 2020, the vacancy was advertised and an appointment decision was made in November 2020. However, HR later had to withdraw the offer due to unsatisfactory references and the post was re-advertised in February 2021. This second recruitment process was completed and an appointment decision made in July 2021, however delays then occurred in processing the contract, mainly caused by the fact that the selected candidate, who was employed in another international organization operating the UN salary system, was not offered by HR a similar level contract with the appropriate level of benefits and entitlements. The candidate therefore declined the offer since this would have meant a significant reduction in pay and pension benefits. It was only when the Regional Director appealed to the Secretary General that the matter was resolved and the contract was signed. The selected candidate will take up post in December 2021.
33. This case underlines the need for ICAO to review and ensure that HR rules and their implementation are aligned with practices of other UN organizations in appropriately recognizing career progression gained in other UN system organizations, so as to minimize the risk of losing the best candidates due to a lack of competitiveness.
34. In the case of the P-3 Technical Officer post, the initial recruitment process in 2019 did not result in a sufficient pool of qualified candidates and the post was re-advertised in December 2019. However, this second recruitment process was suspended in early 2020 due to the pandemic and its impact on Regional Office activities. The post was recently advertised for a third time in August 2021. There were also five other Regional Office posts which were filled in 2019 and early 2020, three at the professional level and two at the general service level. The time taken to fill these posts ranged from 8 months to 14.5 months.



Recommendation 4	Filling of vacant posts
Priority	Medium
ADB should:	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) Review HR rules and procedures to ensure that ICAO's practice is aligned with other UN system Organizations in attracting and engaging the best candidates for all vacancies in a timely manner.</li> <li>b) In order to ensure widest possible outreach, consult with Regional Offices and agree on methods for how best to advertise vacancies for technical posts.</li> </ul>	
Closing criteria:	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) Update HR procedures and rules to allow recognition of other UN and International Organizations experience that will allow matching the current benefits and entitlement levels of selected candidates.</li> <li>b) Consultation with Regional Offices for identification of outreach channels for different types of technical posts at the RO level.</li> </ul>	

### Consultants

35. In 2019, ESAF recruited eight Experts to provide technical assistance, support and guidance to four States in the region<sup>2</sup> in their implementation of an ICAO compliant oversight system. The Experts worked in teams and were employed for a period of either 23 or 45 days. The total cost of US \$83,196 (CAN \$110,268) was financed by savings from vacant posts in the Regional Office (three technical officer positions were vacant for a period of time in 2019 before being filled). This was a successful initiative, which allowed ESAF to provide targeted assistance to these States at a time when Regional Office staff resources were stretched. The work was appreciated by the States involved, and this approach of providing assistance to States resulted in cost efficiencies. Using the experience and lessons learned, ESAF office could prepare a report on the impacts achieved and share with other Regional Offices for consideration.

### Gender Equality

36. As shown in Table 1, there is an imbalance in the number of female staff at the professional level in the Regional Office (only 2 of the 12 professional staff are female). However, the recently recruited Administrative Officer is a female and the Regional Office is committed to further increasing the representation of women at the professional level.
37. The ESAF office, represented by the Regional Director, became a member of the Nairobi hub of the International Gender Champions network in 2020. As part of this network, the Regional Director has made two public commitments: to strengthen policies and practices to advance equality and inclusion within ICAO; and to report and respond appropriately to address any allegations of sexual exploitation and abuse.

## IV. Information Technology

38. The user accounts of ESAF staff members are generally managed effectively. The password policy is enforced and all users require multifactor authentication to access systems. All staff members have been provided with VPN access enabling them to work from home during the ongoing

<sup>2</sup> Burundi, Lesotho, Namibia and Zimbabwe.

Covid-19 pandemic. OIO analyzed the Active Directory<sup>3</sup> and confirmed that user identities corresponded with the active staff members of ESAF and that there were no active accounts in respect of separated staff members.

39. All ESAF staff members were having local administrative rights on their office laptops. This creates a risk that staff may download programs on the network without proper permission or vetting. After raising this matter during the audit, action was taken by the Regional Office to remove PC and laptop local administrative privileges for all ESAF users.
40. There were several generic accounts established by ESAF, which were not in use. Inactive or “stale” accounts pose a security risk. Appropriate action was taken to deactivate the unused generic accounts during the audit.
41. The ICT Associate has the passwords of four ESAF administrative accounts. In case he is on leave or otherwise unavailable, there are currently no back up arrangements. OIO was informed that headquarters has recently established a secure vault for storing and retrieving administrative passwords, however ESAF has not yet made use of this.
42. The ESAF servers are hosted and maintained by UNON<sup>4</sup> Data Center. The ESAF office manages the daily and weekly back-ups of data held on the Regional Office servers, however, data from backup tapes has never been tested for restoration.
43. In October 2021, a new back-up process has been set up by Headquarters using cloud storage under the One ICAO project; which will also facilitate restoration of data from cloud storage. The entire data of ESAF held on servers (about 777GB) has already been synced in Azure cloud and further steps are underway to stabilize the cloud storage and backup process thereby eliminating the need for taking physical backups in future.

Recommendation 5	IT controls
Priority	High
ESAF should:	
a) Store the passwords for the ESAF administrative accounts in the secure vault established by headquarters.	
b) Carry out a full system level restoration of the data once the new back-up arrangements are in place and to confirm that the data can be restored from backup site in case of a disaster.	
Closing criteria:	
a) Storage of passwords for the ESAF administrative accounts in the secure vault.	
b) Completion of testing to confirm that data can be fully restored from back-up site.	

## V. Business Continuity and Safety and Security Measures

### Business Continuity Plan

44. The latest version of the ESAF Business Continuity Plan (BCP) was updated and approved in August 2020. Whilst this represents a good attempt to plan for and document how the Regional Office will

<sup>3</sup> Active Directory is Microsoft’s directory service product that contains information for managing users and resources in a computer network.

<sup>4</sup> United Nations Office in Nairobi.

continue to carry out its essential functions in the event of a disaster, there are a number of areas in which the BCP can be improved further.

45. Fully effective business continuity planning is only possible after carrying out a formal business impact analysis (BIA) to identify critical business processes, and to establish the required recovery point objectives (RPOs) and recovery time objectives (RTOs) in respect of each critical function. OIO was informed by the Regional Office that the consultancy firm hired by headquarters (Tech Mahindra) has recently held discussions with ESAF staff on carrying out a BIA. The BCP will therefore need to be updated in the light of the results of this exercise.
46. There is an opportunity for ESAF to learn lessons from the ongoing Covid-19 pandemic including working from home arrangements, exploring ways to conduct business virtually, and ensuring the availability of efficient IT systems, etc. The results of this lessons-learned exercise should be used to update and improve the BCP, and to ensure its practical implementation.

Recommendation 6	Business Continuity Plan
Priority	Medium
ESAF should update the current Business Continuity Plan based on the outcome of the Business Impact Analysis (BIA) being carried out by ADB including lessons learned from the experience of the Covid-19 pandemic.	
Closing criteria:	
Completion of a BIA and lessons learned exercise, and revision/update of the BCP.	

### Safety and Security Measures

47. The UN Department of Security and Safety (UNDSS) provides the uniformed personnel securing the UN complex, in addition to establishing and monitoring the physical security requirements of all offices on the complex, including the ESAF office.
48. Following OIO audit report on Safety and Security Management (IA/2020/1), the Conference, Security and General Services Section (CSG) engaged a consultant to carry out a review of ESAF's compliance with the UNSMS<sup>5</sup> Security Risk Management (SRM) measures for Nairobi. This review was completed in June 2021. ESAF office complies with Headquarters Minimum Operating Security Standards (HMOSS).
49. ESAF staff members have completed the mandatory UN BSAFE security awareness training and have provided copies of their certificates of completion to the administration section.

## VI. Procurement

### Common Services provided by UNON

50. In common with other UN specialized agencies located within the UN compound in Gigiri, ESAF has signed a Memorandum of Understanding with UNON regarding the occupancy and use of premises. Many other services (such as telecommunications, IT services, joint medical services, host country relations services, etc.) are provided by UNON on a common basis and the costs are shared between all of the occupying UN entities on an appropriate apportionment basis. The ESAF office derives significant benefits both from the administrative effort saved and from the economies of scale that these arrangements bring.

---

<sup>5</sup> United Nations Security Management System.

51. In the case of IT services (data hosting and internet services), the Regional Office submits a Purchase Requisition each year and the Procurement Section (PRO) processes this request and issues a Purchase Order (or a change order to a previous Purchase Order). However, despite the fact that no specific procurement action is required since the Regional Office has signed a Service Level Agreement with UNON, the process for raising these Purchase Orders is lengthy which often lead to delays in paying the UNON invoices. There are similar issues whenever ESAF needs to hire the conference facilities provided by UNON for meetings held in the UN complex.
52. ESAF would benefit from a meeting with all relevant parties (PRO, Finance, D/ADB's office, and the Agresso team) to discuss and agree how commitments and invoices for common services provided by UNON could be processed in an expedient manner.

#### Local Purchases

53. In accordance with the ICAO Procurement Code, allotment holders have delegated authority to procure goods and services up to CAN \$10,000. A Direct Purchase Order (DPO) must be raised for all purchases above CAN \$1,000, and in the case of sole source, supported by a valid *Sole Source Justification*. There is high incidence of sole source purchases. Out of the sample of twelve local purchases reviewed by OIO, ten were sole source.
54. PRO has developed a standard form for regional offices to document the procurement process for local purchases below CAN \$10,000. The form (*DPO Summary File for Regional Offices*), should be uploaded to Agresso when creating the DPO, however it is not used by ESAF.
55. In the absence of an Administrative Officer, lack of segregation of duties was noted especially in areas such as verification of invoices before payment and check/payment instructions to bank.

### VII. Hiring of Translators and Interpreters

56. The ESAF office recruits occasional freelance translators and interpreters to translate official documents and to provide interpretation at meetings. The Regional Office spent CAN \$14,265 on language services in 2019 and CAN \$66,007 in 2020.
57. Administrative Instructions and other written procedures on the recruitment of freelance translators and interpreters are focused at the headquarters level and do not cover the Regional Offices. Lack of organization-wide policies and procedures creates a risk that different parts of the Organization will adopt inconsistent practices.

Recommendation 7	Procedures for recruiting translators and interpreters
Priority	Medium
ADB should ensure that the current Administrative Instructions relating to the recruitment of freelance translators and interpreters also include the Regional Offices.	
Closing criteria:	
Updating of organization-wide procedures for the hiring of freelance interpreters and translators.	

### VIII. Asset Management

58. The ESAF asset inventory record was last certified as accurate and complete by the Regional Director in January 2020. OIO selected a sample of equipment stored in the IT storage room and different locations of ESAF office and checked that the items were correctly recorded on the inventory record.

59. There are two vehicles in the inventory of ESAF. The log books of both the vehicles were reviewed in audit and controls around maintenance of log books were found satisfactory.

## IX. Home Security Payments

60. Professional staff are entitled to receive reimbursement for eligible costs associated with securing their homes in accordance with the UN Minimum Operating Residential Security Standards (MORSS) applicable to Kenya. These payments are calculated by the ESAF Office and are paid locally on a periodic basis (usually quarterly or bi-annually).
61. OIO selected and tested a sample of 10 payments made to staff in the period January 2019 to June 2021. Due to an administrative error, one staff member was paid twice for the months of January to May 2019 resulting in an overpayment of KES 165,000 (approximately CAN \$2,250). The Regional Office has informed OIO that it will take the necessary action to recover this money.
62. Human error risk is high in such manually calculated payments, particularly in the absence of “four eyes principle”. Enhancing internal controls and segregation of duties will minimize the associated risks.

## ANNEX 1: DEFINITION OF AUDIT TERMS

---

### Audit Ratings

In providing an overall assessment of the results of the audit, OIO uses the following standardized audit rating definitions:

Audit Assessment	Definition
Effective	Controls evaluated are adequate, appropriate, and effective to provide reasonable assurance that risks are being managed and objectives should be met.
Some Improvement Needed	A few specific control weaknesses or areas for improvement were noted; generally however, controls evaluated are adequate, appropriate, and effective to provide reasonable assurance that risks are being managed and objectives should be met.
Major Improvement Needed	Several key control weaknesses were noted and/or several areas of strategic/high importance were identified where significant improvements can be made to increase efficiency and effectiveness.
Unsatisfactory	Controls evaluated are not adequate, appropriate, or effective to provide reasonable assurance that risks are being managed and objectives should be met.

Internal control is defined as a process effected by senior management and staff, designed to provide reasonable assurance regarding the achievement of objectives relating to operations, reporting and compliance objectives. Whilst internal control provides reasonable (but not absolute) assurance of achieving organizational objectives, limitations may result from:

- suitability of objectives established as a precondition to internal control;
- reality that human judgment in decision making can be faulty and subject to bias;
- breakdowns can occur because of human failures such as simple errors;
- ability of management to override internal control;
- ability of management, other staff, and/or third parties to circumvent controls through collusion;
- external events beyond the organization's control.

### Priority of Audit Recommendations

The audit recommendations in this report are categorized according to priority as a guide to management in addressing the issues raised. The following categories are used:

High: recommendations which address significant and/or pervasive deficiencies or control weaknesses, or areas where significant improvements can be made.

Medium: recommendations which address important deficiencies or control weaknesses, or areas where some improvements can be made.

Low: suggestions which represent best practice, or general opportunities for improvement.

## ANNEX 2: MANAGEMENT ACTION PLAN

Ref.	Recommendation	Priority Rating	Accepted (Y/N)	Management Comments	Agreed Actions	Office/ Section Responsible	Target Date
1.	ESAF, in association with SPCP, should ensure a) Availability of CMRT for regular reporting, b) Effective linkage of Regional Office operating plans with corporate and RO risk registers as well as individual staff performance objectives in PACE.	High	Yes	a) The ESAF/RO has erratic CMRT access and does not have any control for the development and operationalization of the tool. The RO will endeavour to implement/report using CMRT as required. b) The ESAF/RO will revise and update the RO risk register to include RO specific risks. The register will ensure linkage with the Operating Plan and ensure staff familiarity with the system and the tools including PACE.	In liaison with SPCP take action on item 1 (a) to ensure that ESAF has un interrupted access to CMRT tool.  Take action on item (b) by revising the RO risk register, conducting awareness of alignment with PACE and Operating Plan.	ESAF/RO	30.06.2022
2.	ESAF should ensure that all planned missions are clearly linked to the achievement of an expected outcome in the operating plan, and that mission reports provide information on actual outcomes achieved with reference to operating plan objectives and targets.	Medium	Yes	ESAF Office agree to improve linkage of all planned missions to expected outcomes in the operating plan. RO will ensure that mission reports include outcomes achieved vis-à-vis the expected objectives and targets of the OP, Work programmes and PACE.	Develop procedure(s) to guide the linkage of planned missions and objectives and reporting processes to expected outcomes and targets of the OP, WPs and PACE.	ESAF/RO	30.04.2022

Ref.	Recommendation	Priority Rating	Accepted (Y/N)	Management Comments	Agreed Actions	Office/ Section Responsible	Target Date
3.	ESAF, in close cooperation with SPCP, should update its RO Risk Register ensuring that all key risks are identified and managed effectively to ensure the achievement of business plan/ operation plan objectives.	High	Yes	The ESAF RO will revise the risk register and include RO specific risks and submit in collaboration with SPCP.	Update and revise the ESAF/RO risk register accordingly.	ESAF/RO	30.06.2022
4.	ADB should: a) Review HR rules and procedures to ensure that ICAO's practice is aligned with other UN system Organizations in attracting and engaging the best candidates for all vacancies in a timely manner. b) Consult with Regional Offices and agree on methods for how best to advertise vacancies for technical posts in the regions to ensure the widest possible outreach.	Medium	Yes	ADB will be the focal point and responsible for the action to address the subject recommendation.	RO to coordinate with ADB on implementation of relevant actions	ADB, RCP	30.06.2022
5.	ESAF should: a) Store the passwords for the ESAF administrative accounts in the secure vault established by headquarters. b) Carry out a full system level restoration of the data once the new back-up arrangements are in place and to confirm that the data can be restored from backup site in case of a disaster.	High	Yes	a) Request for License already submitted to CSIM by RO. Once provided, passwords for the ESAF administrative accounts will be stored in the secure vault at headquarters b) Azure Cloud backup was recently implemented in October 2021 for all ICAO ROs. Awaiting ICAO CSIM instructions to test backup restoration.	Coordinate with CSIM and monitor the effective storage in secure vault  Coordinate with CSIM and monitor the testing of backup	ESAF/RO AND HQ – CSIM  ESAF/RO AND HQ – CSIM	30.06.2022  31.12.2022



Ref.	Recommendation	Priority Rating	Accepted (Y/N)	Management Comments	Agreed Actions	Office/ Section Responsible	Target Date
6.	ESAF should update the current Business Continuity Plan based on the outcome of the Business Impact Analysis (BIA) being carried out by ADB including lessons learned from the experience of the Covid-19 pandemic.	Medium	Yes	The BIA results and lessons learnt from emergency activation since March 2020, will inform update of ESAF BCP.	Appropriately update the BCP to ensure robustness and applicability.	ESAF/RO	31.05.2022
7.	ADB should ensure that the current Administrative Instructions relating to the recruitment of freelance translators and interpreters also include the Regional Offices.	Medium	Yes	To eliminate the existing inconsistencies, the current Administrative Instructions should be aligned with the Market rates of the ROs locations. Once instructions are issued, HQ should liaise with ROs and the relevant focal points for effective implementation.	Coordinate with ADB to foster expeditious action to address the existing inconsistency.	ADB, LP	30.06.2022