



International Civil Aviation Organization

**The Special Coordination Meeting for the Bay of Bengal area (SCM/BOB)
and The Sixteenth Meeting of the Bay of Bengal ATS Coordination Group
(BBACG/16)**

Bangkok, Thailand, 31 January – 4 February 2005

Agenda Item 7: Any Other Business

REVIEW OF CIVIL/MILITARY SEMINAR 2004

(Presented by the Secretariat)

SUMMARY

This paper presents the summary meeting report of the ICAO Civil/Military Coordination Seminar (December 2004) and highlights the Asia/Pacific Regional Civil/Military Co-operation Guidelines contained in the ASIA/PAC FASID (Doc 9673, 2001) for review by the meeting.

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 In considering the safety, security and efficiency of civil aviation, the Asia/Pacific Air Navigation Planning and Implementation Group (APANPIRG) routinely reviews aspects of the coordination and cooperation between civil and military organizations.

1.2 As part of its deliberations in this regard, APANPIRG/13 (September 2002) gave strong endorsement to the following conclusion:

Conclusion 13/34 – Strengthening the Civil/Military Coordination Programme

That, due to an increase in military activity within and adjacent to the Asia/Pacific Region,

1. States are urged to:

- a) remain vigilant with regard to military activity within or near their area of responsibility;*
- b) continue effective civil/military coordination with military authorities concerned; and,*
- c) advise and coordinate with adjacent States and ICAO of any significant increase in military activity which may have an affect on international aircraft operations.*

2. ICAO to arrange an Asia/Pacific Regional Seminar on Civil/Military Coordination and, if considered necessary, to follow-up with sub-regional Civil/Military Co-ordination Workshops in areas as deemed appropriate.

1.3 Pursuant to Clause 2 of APANPIRG Conclusion 13/34, the Regional Office had arranged the 2004 ICAO Civil/Military Coordination seminar, which was held at the Regional Office from 14-17 December 2004. The seminar was attended by 67 civil and military participants from 12 States and 2 International Organizations.

1.4 The previous Asia/Pacific ICAO Civil/Military Coordination Seminar had been held during May 1998.

2. DISCUSSION

2.1 The summary report of the 2004 ICAO Civil/Military Coordination Seminar is attached to this working paper for review by the meeting.

2.2 Appendix A to the summary report comprises the *Asia/Pacific Regional Civil Military Co-operation Guidelines*, as contained in Part VIII ‘Airspace management’ of the ASIA/PAC FASID (Facilities and Services Implementation Document, Doc 9673, 2001).

2.3 The seminar had reviewed the *Guidelines* and had not identified any need to amend the existing provisions. However, the seminar urged States not to be complacent in regard to existing national provisions relating to civil/military coordination, to undertake a thorough review of current arrangements in the light of ICAO provisions and the deliberations of the seminar and to incorporate the FASID *Guidelines* in all current and future airspace planning.

2.4 The seminar had noted that effectual cooperation and coordination between civil and military agencies was essential for the safety, security and efficiency of international civil aviation and had endorsed the principle adopted by the previous regional Civil/Military seminar (1998), that of the ***equitable sharing of both convenience and inconvenience*** by civil and military users.

2.5 In conclusion, the seminar had agreed that the requirements of clause 2 of APANPIRG Conclusion 13/34 regarding the conduct of a regional Civil/Military seminar had been well met by the seminar programme. The seminar noted the further provision of clause 2 of Conclusion 13/34, which required ICAO to follow up the seminar “... *with sub-regional Civil/Military coordination workshops in areas as deemed appropriate.*” The seminar did not identify any current additional need for follow up sub-regional Civil/Military coordination workshops and considered that workshops could always be arranged later, as and when required by prevailing circumstances.

3 ACTION BY THE MEETING

3.1 The meeting is invited to:

- a) review and note the summary report of the 2004 ICAO Civil/Military Coordination Seminar;
- b) review the Asia/Pacific Regional Civil/Military Co-operation Guidelines as contained in Part VIII the ASIA/PAC FASID (Doc 9673, 2001); and
- c) identify any actions arising from the report of the 2004 ICAO Civil/Military Seminar.

.....

ICAO ASIA AND PACIFIC OFFICE

SUMMARY REPORT OF THE CIVIL/MILITARY COORDINATION SEMINAR

BANGKOK, THAILAND, 14-17 December 2004

1. Introduction

1.1 Mr. Lalit B Shah, Regional Director of the ICAO Asia and Pacific Office, officially opened the Civil/Military Coordination Seminar. In his opening address, Mr. Shah welcomed all participants and emphasized the immediacy and importance of effective civil/military coordination and the flexible use of airspace in addressing the forecast regional traffic growth in the near term, as well as the long term requirements of international civil aviation. Mr. Shah noted that the previous regional Civil/Military seminar had been conducted during May 1998, and that the conduct of this regional seminar was therefore very timely.

1.2 Mr. Andrew Tiede, Regional Officer ATM, ICAO Regional Office, Bangkok, acted as the moderator for the seminar. He was assisted by Mr. David Moores, Regional Officer ATM, ICAO Regional Office, Bangkok. Both officers made ICAO related presentations to the seminar.

1.3 Mr. Tiede updated the meeting regarding the provisions of APANPIRG Conclusion 13/34, which was formulated by APANPIRG/13 in September 2002. Clause 2 of Conclusion 13/34 required ICAO to arrange an Asia and Pacific regional seminar on Civil/Military coordination and, if considered necessary, to follow up with sub-regional Civil/Military coordination workshops in areas as deemed appropriate.

1.4 The Regional Office had arranged the seminar pursuant to the requirements of clause 2 of Conclusion 13/34. The purpose of the seminar was to forge closer understanding and cooperation between Civil and Military authorities in the Asia and Pacific Region to enhance safety, security and efficiency of international civil aviation.

1.5 The seminar was attended by 67 participants from 12 Contracting States of the Asia/Pacific Region and 2 International Organizations. The working language of the seminar was English.

2. Civil/Military Coordination – ICAO Provisions

2.1 The Secretariat emphasized the availability and importance of ICAO documentation relating to the provision of Civil/Military coordination. Emphasis was placed on the over-riding nature of the obligation of States under Article 3(d) of the Convention on International Civil Aviation which stated “*The Contracting States undertake, when issuing regulations for their State aircraft, that they will have due regard for the safety of navigation of civil aircraft*” The seminar also reviewed the relevant provisions of Article 3 bis of the Convention.

2.2 In addition to the Convention on International Civil Aviation, the attention of the seminar was directed to the provisions, outcomes and recommendations in relation to Civil/ Military matters, of the following:

- a) Annex 11 – *Air Traffic Services*;
- b) Document 9433 – *Manual Concerning Interception of Civil Aircraft*;
- c) Document 9554 – *Manual Concerning Safety Measures Relating to Military Activities Potentially Hazardous to Civil Aircraft Operations*;

- d) Third Regional Air Navigation Meeting (RAN/3, 1993);
- e) previous Asia and Pacific Regional Civil Military Coordination Seminar (1998);
- f) APANPIRG (1997 – 2004);
- g) 11th Air Navigation Conference (2003); and
- h) 35th Assembly of ICAO (2004).

2.3 In particular, the seminar noted Recommendation 1/2 of the 11th Air Navigation Conference (September/October 2003), which stated:

‘That States take appropriate action to coordinate the global ATM operational concept with their military authorities with a view to achieving maximum cooperation and integration in an effort to implement a flexible and cooperative approach to airspace organization and management.’

2.4 The seminar also noted clause 1 of Resolution 35/14, Appendix P, of the 35th Assembly of ICAO (September/October 2004), which stated:

“the common use by civil and military aviation of airspace and of certain facilities and services shall be arranged so as to ensure the safety, regularity and efficiency of international civil air traffic;”

3 Regional Guidelines

3.1 The seminar recalled that APANPIRG/9 (August 1998) had considered the *Asia/Pacific Regional Civil/Military Cooperation Guidelines* that had been drafted during the 1998 regional Civil Military Coordination seminar, and had endorsed the guidelines for inclusion in the Air Traffic Management Section of the ASIA/PAC Facilities and Services Implementation Document (FASID, Document 9673) of the regional Air Navigation Plan. In reviewing the 2001 FASID regional guidelines, the seminar did not identify a need to propose amendments to the current guidelines. A copy of the guidelines is attached as an **Appendix**.

4 Seminar Discussion

4.1 In discussing the practical application of the foregoing principles, the seminar noted that whilst the ready availability of airspace and facilities was of prime importance to the efficient operation of international aircraft operators, the existence of an effective defence force was also vital to national economic health and stability. The seminar also acknowledged the very significant role played by the military in regard to humanitarian missions all over the world, noting the substantial access required by the military to civil airspace in order to perform these missions. Therefore the seminar noted that effectual cooperation and coordination was essential and again endorsed the principle adopted by the previous regional Civil/Military seminar (1998), that of the ***equitable sharing of both convenience and inconvenience*** by civil and military users.

4.2 The seminar urged States not to be complacent in regard to existing national provisions relating to civil/military coordination and to undertake a thorough review of prevailing arrangements in the light of ICAO provisions and the deliberations of the seminar.

5 Presentations

5.1 The following presentations were made during the conduct of the seminar. An electronic CD-ROM copy of all presentations was compiled during the seminar and distributed to delegates.

- a) ICAO Provisions on Civil/Military Coordination
(Mr. Andrew Tiede, Regional Officer ATM, ICAO Regional Office, Bangkok);
- b) Headquarters Pacific Air Force View on Civil/Military Cooperation
(Colonel William Schaake, Chief Air Battle Management Division, Pacific Air Forces, USAF);
- c) Civil/Military Coordination in Thailand
(Dr Paisit Herabat, Executive Officer, System Engineering AEROTHAI, Thailand);
- d) ICAO Asia/Pacific Regional ATM Initiatives
(Mr. David Moores, Regional Officer ATM, ICAO Regional Office, Bangkok);
- e) ATM Operational Concept – Future Directions
(Mr. David Moores);
- f) Civil/Military Coordination – The Indian Context
(Mr Srikrishan, Executive Director ATM, Airports Authority of India);
- g) Military ‘Due Regard’ Operations
(Mr. Allan Storm, USAF Flight Standards Agency, Civil/Military Aviation Issues);
- h) Civil/Military Coordination for the National Airspace of the United States
(Mr. Allan Storm);
- i) Upgrade to 406 MHz Emergency Locator Beacons (ELTs & PLBs)
(Mr Allan Storm);
- j) Civil/Military Co-ordination in Air Traffic Management
(Mr. Allan Storm);
- k) Civil/Military Operations in Singapore
(Major M.G.R. Maran, Republic of Singapore Air Force);
- l) Japan – Civil/Military Coord and Air traffic Management Centre Operation
(Mr. Yoshinori Suzuki, Japan Civil Aviation Bureau);
- m) Gatekeeper
(Mr. Ken Sayler, Command Airspace Manager, Pacific Air Forces, United States Air Force);
- n) Consequences
(Mr. Ken Sayler);
- o) Pacific Military Altitude Reservation Function (PACMARF) Military Airspace Reservations (ALTRV)
(Mr. Ken Sayler);
- p) Civil Aviation Developments in Afghanistan
(Mr. Art Gumtau, USAF Contractor (AFCAP-CENTAF), Kabul, Afghanistan);

- q) Airline Efficiency of Flight Operations – Pilot Perspectives
(Captain Greg Wolfsheimer, IFALPA)
- r) Controllers’ Perspectives on Military Operations
(Mr. John Wagstaff, IFATCA);
- s) Civil Military Airspace Conference Mechanisms (CMAC)
(Major Kevin Westley, DoD Policy Board on Federal Aviation, Pentagon);
- t) Regional Airspace Initiative Program Overview
(Major Kevin Westley);

5.2 The presentations provided a broad overview of the arrangements and procedures in place in a wide range of locations to ensure the cooperative and equitable use of airspace and other facilities. Many presentations highlighted the fact that airspace is a resource which is becoming increasingly limited as civil and military aviation activities continue to increase.

6 Conclusion

6.1 The seminar agreed that the requirements of clause 2 of APANPIRG Conclusion 13/34 regarding the conduct of a regional Civil/Military seminar had been well met by the seminar programme. The seminar noted the further provision of clause 2 of Conclusion 13/34, which required ICAO to follow up the seminar “... with sub-regional Civil/Military coordination workshops in areas as deemed appropriate.” The seminar did not identify any current additional need for follow up sub-regional Civil Military coordination workshops and considered that workshops could always be arranged later, as and when required by prevailing circumstances.

6.2 The seminar had reviewed the *Asia/Pacific Regional Civil/Military Cooperation Guidelines* as described in the FASID and had not identified any need to amend these existing provisions. However, the seminar urged States not to be complacent in regard to existing national provisions relating to civil/military coordination, to undertake a thorough review of current arrangements in the light of ICAO provisions and the deliberations of the seminar and to incorporate the FASID guidelines in all current and future airspace planning.

6.4 It was agreed that the seminar had provided delegates with a most worthwhile forum for the open discussion of common problems related to civil/military coordination and, importantly, had allowed States to provide others with an insight into the manner in which some of these problems had been addressed.

6.5 In formally closing the seminar, Mr. Tiede thanked all presenters for the high quality, relevant and informative presentations made during the seminar. Mr Tiede observed that although there were many regional examples of effective civil military coordination, there were also many areas in which improvements could, and should, be made, and that improvements were critically important to ensure that States were in a position to service the forecast increases in regional traffic activity. Mr. Tiede thanked all delegates for their active participation at the seminar and urged all participants to use the focus provided by the seminar to generate an ongoing interchange of opinions and ideas in order that the potential benefits of the forum could be fully realized.

.....

Extracted from ASIA/PAC FASID (Doc 9673, 2001), Part V.III Airspace Management

Appendix A to PART V.III

ASIA/PACIFIC REGIONAL CIVIL/MILITARY CO-OPERATION GUIDELINES

- a) procedures should, whenever possible, conform to the civil aviation rules and regulations developed by ICAO or the State concerned;
- b) aeronautical facilities and ground services required for civil or military use should ideally be provided jointly or on a common, integrated basis;
- c) personnel in civil and military ATS units should be required to meet equal standards in training and rating, based on applicable ICAO provisions;
- d) neither the military nor the civil authority should unilaterally establish controlled and/or reserved or restricted airspace;
- e) duplication of effort in research and development as well as in practical operations should be avoided and ground facilities, equipment and services should be shared whenever practical;
- f) common terminology and abbreviations should be developed and used by both users of the airspace in order to avoid confusion in communication and correspondence. Such terms and abbreviations should, whenever possible, be those developed and published by ICAO;
- g) common rules and procedures applicable to civil and military air traffic, based on the appropriate provisions of ICAO, should be developed for use by both civil and military aircraft. These rules should, where necessary, be supplemented by specific rules covering particular operational requirements of either user. In addition, these rules should be supplemented by common operating practices and procedures. In so far as they are of concern to both users, these rules and procedures should be published in a manner so as to facilitate cross reference;
- h) plans regarding the organization and use of airspace should be developed in collectively by the civil and military authorities and take account of the following factors:
 - 1) national security requirements;
 - 2) co-sharing of airspace in the interest of safety, flexibility, efficiency and economy of air traffic.
 - 3) the desirability of joint use of airspace by the provision of suitable services including radar;
 - 4) compatibility of civil and military operations in the same general area;

APPENDIX

- 5) the need for keeping airspace reservations and restrictions to a minimum, so that minimal interference with civil or military air operations occurs;
 - 6) the need to periodically review and assess the continued requirement for airspace restrictions;
 - 7) consideration of the effects of incompatibility between civil and military navigation and communication equipment;
 - 8) the inconvenience caused to each user where conflict of interest occurs between civil and military users; and
 - 9) the need for joint consultation prior to the establishment of new aerodromes, military installations, navigation aids and other facilities which, once completed, have an impact on the organization and use of the airspace.
- i) military exercises having an impact on air navigation should be coordinated in such a manner that early liaison is established between the exercise planners and the appropriate civil authorities.

.....